

Review of Sanger, Patrick and Sandra Scheuble-Reiter, eds. *Soldner und Berufssoldaten in der griechischen Welt: Soziale und politische Gestaltungsrume*, Historia Einzelschrift 269, Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2022. ISBN: 9783515133128.

Paul Johstono, Air University, paul.johstono@au.af.edu

This volume grew from a conference held at Halle in 2016 to explore the sociocultural history and mentalite of mercenaries, reckoned omnipresent in the Greek world. It comprises fourteen papers in four sections, as well as an introduction. Half the papers are in English, five in German, and two in French. With a few exceptions, the volume focuses on the Late Classical and Hellenistic periods. The volume concludes with an impressive and useful set of indices, containing sources, personal names, places, and Greek terms (with two demotic Egyptian expressions). Its breadth of coverage, incorporation of much new evidence, and numerous compelling arguments assure this volume will be an important resource for anyone working historical problems related to mercenaries in ancient Greece.

The introduction begins with Isokrates' polemic in 355 BC against Athens' reliance on mercenaries, presented as proof that the reputation of mercenaries (and, by extension, professional soldiers, or berufssoldaten) was "already, like today, remarkably bad" (11 – "wie auch heutzutage – denkbar schlecht"). The editors identify—and perhaps overstate—an ancient and modern stereotype that contrasts "homeless" mercenaries, who shift loyalty for pay like a flag in the wind, with patriotic citizen-soldiers ready to die for their country. In fact, the thematic areas of study are plainly valuable contributions with or without the mercenary's terrible reputation. The fourteen chapters are grouped around these themes, addressing the tension between the idea and the reality, the political and legal status of mercenaries, their social status and activity, and the entanglements of "mercenaries" with other types of military service.

The critical question for work on Greek mercenaries is definitional. The last page of the volume reiterates a narrow definition of the mercenary: military specialists recruited for a particular cause and specific military operation of a correspondingly limited time (288 – "eine Anwerbung militarischer „Sonderkrafte“ fur einen speziellen Anlass und einen konkreten kriegerischen Einsatz von entsprechend begrenztem Zeitraum"). But Klinkott's definition fits few of the cases studied in the rest of the book and differs from other definitions offered therein, like Tuplin's: "A mercenary promotes the interests of a state/individual, is paid to do so, and is not compelled, prompted, or qualified by other considerations of ethnicity or community affiliation" (235 n.4). The volume would have benefited from adopting a common definition, or common methodology for handling the nomenclature of paid military service. The inconsistency in definition and thus in nomenclature disrupts the social historical approach because the subject, their subjectivity, and mentality are unstable across contributions (23).

The first section of the volume, *Ideologie oder Wirklichkeit*, offers three chapters that interrogate the dichotomy between citizen soldiers and mercenaries. First, Bettali focuses on Demosthenes, whose oratory, like Isokrates', contains numerous criticisms of mercenaries.

Bettali argues that Demosthenes' rhetoric was driven by his philosophy of state power, which idealized citizen-soldiers serving in field armies and winning decisive battles. Mercenaries, for no outstanding fault of their own, suffered polemical assaults as Demosthenes tried to convince the Athenian assembly to mobilize their own citizens. Next, Burckhardt takes up Xenophon's view of mercenaries, as a counter to the more caustic positions of Isokrates or Demosthenes. In Xenophon's *Anabasis* Burckhardt finds mercenaries that maintain cohesion under stress, engage in political activity, and build community despite their heterogeneity and distance from home. While Burckhardt's work agrees with Bettali's that Attic oratory attacked mercenaries as part of a rhetorical strategy, he also finds the political mentality of the Ten Thousand was limited by the resilience of their ancestral, local identities. In the last chapter of Part I, Scheuble-Reiter shifts the focus to the families of mercenaries. After challenging a historiographic tendency to describe mercenaries as rogues and womanizers, Scheuble-Reiter's study considers the evidence for mercenaries' families and Hellenistic states' care for the families of mercenaries, even after their death. Provision for mercenaries benefited the Successor kingdoms as they sought to induce mercenaries and their families to settle permanently and enter professional military service (72).

Part II, "Politische und rechtliche Implikationen" contains four chapters that explore the political and legal implications of mercenaries as residents or even citizens of communities in the lands where they soldiered. Péré-Noguès examines the patterns of mercenary settlement in Sicily's comparatively early "golden age of mercenaries" under the Deinomenid tyrants, down to the Dionsyiads and their competitors. These patterns include colonial (re)foundations and expansion of citizen rolls, patterns familiar in the Hellenistic era, but also serial disenfranchisement, redistribution, and violence from recurring failures to coalesce. Chrysafis takes up the range of interactions mercenary garrison commanders and members had with the local population in the Antigonid garrison system across Greece. Chrysafis impressively pulls together epigraphic evidence and little-known anecdotes from the likes of Plutarch, Polyaeus, and Diogenes Laertius. The discussion of garrison members' residence and activity in urban spaces (95-98) makes up a very small portion of the chapter but suggests potential for a larger, compelling study. Zimmerman makes good use of recently published epigraphic texts regarding Lycia, the Attalid Asklepiastai, Toriaion, and Kleonnaeion. He considers the political, social, and religious ways and means that military populations—ambivalently mercenary, professional, or settler—embedded in, came to the center of, and even transformed communities where they were stationed. Then, van Regenmortel describes an economic approach to the status and impact of increasing mercenary service. This chapter contains an excellent evaluation of the historiography of the mercenary-citizen soldier dichotomy (123-126). She deflects the elite critiques of mercenaries that appear in Isocrates, Demosthenes and elsewhere by pointing to plentiful counterevidence for the increased acceptance of different types of mercenary service at Athens and by Athenians, as well as the socioeconomic benefits that mercenary service introduced.

Part III, *Die Söldner als soziale Individuen und Gemeinschaften*, offers four chapters that interrogate the individual and corporate identities of mercenaries. Dana questions the tradition of barbarian mercenaries "sans attaches" by revisiting a now-expanded dossier of texts dealing with Thracian mercenaries from Thrace. Dana concludes that the Thracians, although "barbarian"

mercenaries, likely settled, associated, and acculturated within the broader Hellenistic military milieu. Sanger considers the several references to *politeumata*, or political associations, among the numerous soldier stelae found at Sidon in Phoenicia. Sanger convincingly argues against the common association of the *politeumata* of Kaunos, Termessos Minor, and Pinara with the ethnic *politeumata* that appeared in the Ptolemaic space by the mid-second century. Fischer-Bovet analyzes the ways that military contingents in the Ptolemaic state sought social capital by communicating trustworthiness in dedications. Most dedications honored the royals and/or senior officials, and Fischer-Bovet argues these practices aimed to build trust and create a stable presence in local communities where soldiers were stationed. Last, Vandorpe covers the rise of the “Persian” “man-receiving-pay” or *misthophoros* in the Thebaid in the Late Ptolemaic dynasty. Counterintuitively, the Persian *misthophoroi* were local Egyptian soldiers with Greek *noms de guerre* who formed the largest standing and reserve contingents of the Ptolemaic army in the Thebaid.

The fourth and final section of the volume, Grundsatzliche Perspektiven bzw. Perspektivwechsel, contains three chapters that grapple with historiographic problems around identifying mercenaries and ancient states’ attitudes toward employing mercenaries versus other types of soldiers. First, Sekunda tackles the rather difficult distinction between allied (symmachic) contingents and mercenary contingents retained as a permanent force in Hellenistic dynastic armies. Sekunda’s study, focused mostly on Cretans, attempts to mine the available evidence to distinguish paid allies from mercenaries but suffers at times from unjustifiably bold conjectures, for example, that Boeotian *symmachoi* formed the contingent of peltasts in the Ptolemaic army at Raphia (223-225). Tuplin’s is the first of two concluding contributions that explore mercenary service in Achaemenid armies. Tuplin’s detailed and lengthy appendix (247-255) will be an excellent resource for anyone working in this arena. In the volume’s final chapter, Klinkott argues that the Achaemenid military was not a force that normally employed mercenaries as mercenaries. He argues, referencing the Legion Etrangere, that foreign troops do not have to be mercenaries, nor do paid troops, and in particular troops incorporated into relatively permanent structures of the host military ought not be labeled mercenaries. His engagement with documentary evidence from Babylonia and Elephantine highlights these attempts to integrate mercenaries permanently.

The volume’s breadth is a great asset, spanning from 5th century Sicily and Mesopotamia to the twilight of the Hellenistic kingdoms in the 2nd century BC. For example, Klinkott’s contribution provides excellent comparative material with those from Pere-Nogues and Zimmerman. So is its authors’ incorporation of newer sources and careful readings of older sources. A frequent theme is the efforts by states and mercenaries to see the latter integrated into the former through settlement, often with accompanying rights, privileges, and land. An under-developed problem that runs across many chapters is the prevalence of standing soldiers, the *berufssoldaten*, who fall in the gap between the citizen-soldier and mercenary. This volume should help others connect disparate sub-fields to their own projects and challenge scholars to contemplate further the social history of Classical and Hellenistic military personnel.

Table of Contents

Einleitung (Patrick Sanger and Sandra Scheuble-Reiter)

Part I. Ideologie oder Wirklichkeit: Die Dichotomie „Burgersoldat – Soldner“

1. Demosthenes, Citizen-Soldiers and Mercenaries (Marco Bettalli)
2. Xenophon, Soldner und die Poleis (Leonhard Burckhardt)
3. Die Soldner und ihre Familie (Sandra Scheuble-Reiter)

Part II. Politische und rechtliche Implikationen: Der Soldner als Einwohner und Mitburger

4. Citoyennete et mercenariat en Sicile du V^e au III^e siecl e avant J.-C. (Sandra Pere-Nogues)
5. Garnisonssoldaten und stadtisches Milieu: Untersuchungen zur Einsetzung antigonidischer Garnisonen in den griechischen Stadten (Charalampos Chrysafis)
6. Chancen und Grenzen der Inklusion: Soldnerkolonien als politisch-gesellschaftlicher Faktor im hellenistischen Kleinasien (Klaus Zimmermann)
7. The Common Enemy of Mankind? Athenian Mercenaries and their Polis in the Late Classical and Early Hellenistic Periods (Charlotte van Regenmortel)

Part III. Die Soldner als soziale Individuen und Gemeinschaften

8. Les Trales (Traleis) dans les sources hellenistiques (Dan Dana)
9. Some Considerations about the Ethnic *Politeumata* of Sidon (Patrick Sanger)
10. Ptolemaic Soldiers in Egypt and Cyprus: Loyalty and Trust in Dedicatory Inscriptions (Christelle Fischer-Bovet)
11. ‘Persian’ Mercenaries with Egyptian Traditions and Hellenizing Intentions: On Native Soldiers in Ptolemaic Thebaid (Katelijn Vandorpe)

Part IV. Grundsatzliche Perspektiven bzw. Perspektivwechsel

12. ‘Retained’ Regiments of Mercenaries and Symmachic Contingents (Nicholas Sekunda)
13. Mercenaries in the Greek World: A Persian Perspective (Christopher Tuplin)
14. Soldner, Siedler und Soldaten? Zum Status von und Umgang mit multiethnischen Streitkraften im Achaimenidenreich (Hilmar Klinkott)